

The Role of Education in Strengthening Religious Moderation in Indonesia

Peran Pendidikan dalam Penguatan Moderasi Beragama di Indonesia

St. Aflahah¹, Khaerun Nisa², and AM Saifullah Aldeia³

¹ Badan Riset dan Inovasi Nasional, Jakarta, Indonesia
stafo01@brin.go.id

² Badan Riset dan Inovasi Nasional, Jakarta, Indonesia
khae003@brin.go.id

³ Badan Riset dan Inovasi Nasional, Jakarta, Indonesia
amsa004@brin.go.id

Paper received : 15th August 2023
Paper revised : 30th October 2023
Paper approved : 20th December 2023

ABSTRACT

Numerous scholarly articles have explored the relationship between education and its role in promoting religious moderation since the concept was introduced in Indonesia. However, only a few articles have been published in journals indexed by Scopus. Concerning Scopus as an accredited journal indexer recognized internationally, this paper's objective was to perform a systematic review of existing literature using the Scopus database from 2019 to 2023 to analyze the significance of education in strengthening religious moderation in Indonesia. The main steps are planning, conducting, and reporting the review. It includes 14 selected articles categorized based on five elements of educational systems: teachers, students, educational objectives, learning management, and educational environments. According to the systematic literature review, education has strengthened religious moderation in Indonesia. It is supported by sufficient teachers' capabilities in teaching religious moderation, students' role as the agents of religious moderation, educational objectives that accommodate religious moderation values, learning managements that use various learning methods and resources, higher thinking order skills, interreligious dialogue, and strategic partnership, and educational environments that provide sufficient learning systems, such as integrating Madrasah Diniyah and Pesantren Universities. However, the implementation still faces challenges requiring more attention from various parties.

Keywords: Education; Religious Moderation; Scopus Database; Systematic Literature Review

ABSTRAK

Telah banyak artikel ilmiah yang membahas peran pendidikan dalam memperkuat konsep moderasi beragama sejak diperkenalkannya konsep tersebut di Indonesia. Namun, hanya sedikit publikasi yang terdapat dalam jurnal yang terindeks oleh Scopus. Karena Scopus diakui secara internasional sebagai pengindeks jurnal yang terakreditasi, tulisan ini bertujuan untuk mengkaji secara sistematis literatur yang ada dengan menggunakan database Scopus pada tahun 2019 hingga 2023 untuk menganalisis pentingnya pendidikan dalam memperkuat moderasi beragama di Indonesia. Langkah utama yang dilakukan adalah perencanaan, penyusunan, dan pelaporan hasil tinjauan. Terdapat 14 artikel yang dikategorikan berdasarkan elemen sistem pendidikan: pendidik, siswa, tujuan pendidikan, manajemen pembelajaran, dan lingkungan pendidikan. Berdasarkan kajian literatur sistematis, diperoleh hasil bahwa pendidikan telah memperkuat moderasi beragama di Indonesia. Hal ini didukung oleh kemampuan guru yang memadai dalam mengajarkan moderasi beragama, peran siswa sebagai agen moderasi beragama, tujuan pendidikan yang mengakomodir nilai-nilai moderasi beragama, manajemen pembelajaran yang menggunakan berbagai metode dan sumber belajar, higher order thinking skill, dialog antaragama, dan kemitraan strategis, serta lingkungan pendidikan yang menyediakan sistem pembelajaran yang memadai, seperti mengintegrasikan Madrasah Diniyah dan Pesantren Universitas. Namun pelaksanaannya masih menghadapi beberapa tantangan yang memerlukan perhatian lebih dari berbagai pihak.

Kata Kunci: Moderasi Beragama; Pendidikan; Database Scopus; Tinjauan Literatur Sistematis.

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia, as a democratic nation, ensures the freedom of its citizens, particularly in their right to freely embrace and practice their religion. Six religions are officially recognized in Indonesia: Islam, Christian, Catholic, Hindu, Buddha, and Confucius. Everyone has the right to choose the religion he believes in. This condition could develop religious tolerance among people. Conversely, while religious liberty can lead to conflicts arising from differing religious beliefs, religious moderation arises to address and manage these issues.

Religious moderation involves maintaining a balanced outlook and behavior without religious extremism. It plays a crucial role in the country, evident by its inclusion in the *Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional (RPJMN) 2020–2024*. Since 2019, the Indonesian Minister of Religion has been implementing rational and systematic strategies to promote moderate religious views, attitudes, and behavior, aiming to instill these values in every citizen to foster the development of Indonesia's Human Resources.

The Indonesian Ministry of Religion has implemented a specific strategy to promote religious moderation in tertiary institutions, particularly State Islamic Universities. This strategy involves the establishment of the "House of Moderation," as outlined in the Ministry of Religion's policy. To ensure its execution, the Director General of Islamic Education issued a Circular Letter and directed each campus. The major goal is to fortify all aspects of the university and protect it from any potential radicalization threats (Islamic Education Directorate General 2020).

The focus on tertiary education as a key aspect of the religious moderation strategy highlights the significant role of education in promoting religious moderation in Indonesia. Educational institutions serve as ideal platforms for nurturing religious moderation as they provide opportunities to enhance student's awareness of diversity and facilitate constructive dialogue among them. Consequently, these institutions can effectively function as laboratories for promoting religious moderation (Sutrisno 2019). Some research findings also show that education can strengthen religious moderation. It includes education management (Faisal 2020), the Islamic religious education curriculum (Suprpto 2020), and the roles of religion teachers (Ar 2020). Research conducted at various educational levels has consistently demonstrated that education plays a vital role in enhancing religious moderation in Indonesia. The findings consistently show that through education, individuals are more likely to adopt moderate religious perspectives and attitudes, leading to a positive impact on society.

Many articles have been published and are a handy additional reference for readers, especially regarding the role of education in strengthening religious moderation in Indonesia. However, only a few articles focus on the Scopus-indexed journals, which are accredited and recognized internationally. It cannot be denied that publications in international journals such as Scopus can bring the discourse of religious moderation to the global level. Scientific discussion from an international perspective can enrich the data on religious moderation in Indonesia.

Hence, this article analyzes how education enhances religious moderation in Indonesia using evidence from the Scopus database. Analyzing the existing literature in the Scopus database can help describe any research results obtained and become a consideration for conducting research with similar themes. One method that can be used in reviewing existing articles is Systematic Literature Review (SLR), which is a carefully thought-out review that aims to address specific research problems by identifying, choosing, and analyzing the findings of the studies included in the review using an explicit and systematic process (Rother 2007). Given the limited articles focusing on religious moderation from an educational angle, this paper undertakes a comprehensive systematic literature review to ensure a thorough exploration of existing literature. This paper introduces innovation in terms of the SLR methodology, which remains infrequently utilized by scholars, particularly when examining how education contributes to enhancing religious moderation in Indonesia. The Scopus database is also another novelty in this research because the existing articles focused on the articles published in journals indexed by Google Scholar, like a literature examination of religious moderation within higher education in Indonesia (Afwadzi

and Miski 2021) and the progression of studies related to religious moderation aimed at addressing radicalism in Indonesia (Murad and Rizki 2022).

The educational perspective of religious moderation in this study is categorized into five components of education: educators, students, educational objectives, learning management, and educational environments. Therefore, this paper discusses each component by analyzing the relevant literature indexed by Scopus. Ultimately, this study offers an exhaustive examination of the current research findings, thoroughly discussing five key components as part of a meticulous review concerning the significance of education in fostering religious moderation in Indonesia.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Islam has instilled the concept of moderation, known as "*Al-Wasathiyyah*," as described in the Qur'an. However, there are ongoing discussions and interpretations related to its relevance in the present context. The term '*al-wasathiyyah*' derives from *al-wasath* and *al-wasath*, both derived from the verb "*wasatha*". Essentially, *Wasathiyyah* embodies a commendable trait that shields an individual from leaning towards extremism, preserving a balanced and moderate approach (Abror 2020).

Moderation is a principle that extends beyond Islam and is emphasized in various other religions as well. It acts as a quality that promotes a harmonious society and maintains a sense of balance in personal, familial, and communal harmony, leading to more wholesome and harmonious human interactions. Religious moderation can be assessed through four key indicators: 1) tolerance, 2) national commitment, 3) non-violence, and 4) accommodation to local culture. It helps assess the extent to which someone practices and upholds religious moderation and identifies any potential vulnerabilities. Recognizing these vulnerabilities is essential to implement suitable measures and strengthen religious moderation effectively (The Indonesian Ministry of Religion 2019).

The execution of the 2020-2024 RPJMN underlines a strategic emphasis on religious moderation, owing to its importance within the four policy directions of the Government. This prioritization is evident through its inclusion as one of the Priority Programs (PP). The plan for enhancing and promoting religious moderation is further detailed through five Priority Activities, which are translated into several National Priority Projects, each holding substantial importance. Among these projects, one of the National Priority Projects focuses on enhancing perspectives, attitudes, and practices of moderate religion, particularly through strengthening the education system. This project entails various initiatives, including curriculum development with a moderate approach, the improvement of teaching materials and processes, education and training of teachers and education staff, as well as the recruitment of teachers with a moderate mindset. These efforts collectively aim to promote religious moderation and its values within the educational framework, fostering a balanced and inclusive learning environment (The Indonesian Ministry of Religion 2019). This point highlights the critical role of education in strengthening religious moderation in Indonesia.

As a system, education consists of seven components: educators, students, educational materials, educational environment, educational tools and facilities, and educational evaluation (Hidayat and Abdillah 2019). These components must be present in the educational process and constitute an integral unit that fills one another. In discussing religious moderation, each component of education is critical. Regarding the Ministry of Education and Culture's Regulation No. 37 of 2018, only 46 of 96 total Basic Competences of Islamic Religious Education in elementary schools have religious moderation value (Abidin 2021). In addition to the importance of

countering radicalism and religious intolerance in schools, there is a crucial need to enhance the curriculum by incorporating an expanded set of Basic Competencies in Islamic Religious Education. These additional competencies encompass various values of moderation, serving to reinforce the promotion and understanding of balanced religious perspectives among students.

Moreover, the early integration of religious moderation within the school setting is of utmost importance. This approach seeks to impart essential values of religious moderation to students, enabling them to comprehend and embody these principles both within the school setting and the wider community. As a result, teachers hold a central role as educators, crucially ensuring the effective execution of this process. The roles of the teachers include (1) the value system conservator, which is the source of maturity norms; (2) Science value system innovator; (3) Transmitter of the existing value system to students; (4) The existing value system transformer through internal application and behavior, which is then actualized in the process of interaction with students; (5) Organizer establishes a formal and informal accounting for the educational process (Kuswanto 2014). Hence, every area of schooling contributes to the development of moderation in religion.

The Scopus database emphasizes scholarly content. It had almost 27 million publishing records from 1966 to 2004 when it was originally released. Since then, the database's content has substantially increased to contain over 76 million records, covering publications from 1788 to 2019. This puts it among the largest and most carefully curated bibliographic databases. About three million new articles are uploaded to it annually. More than 39,100 serial publications (of which more than 24,500 titles provide the most recent content), 120,000 conference proceedings, and 206,000 volumes from more than 5,000 different publishers worldwide are just a few of the many sources from which Scopus obtains its content (Baas et al. 2020).

As a curated database, Scopus puts its content through a stringent selection procedure. Publishers and editorial boards contribute serial content for possible inclusion in Scopus, such as book series, conference papers, and journals. These submissions are subjected to stringent evaluation and selection criteria for scientific rigor and quality. An external Content Selection and Advisory Board (CSAB) of impartial scientists with in-depth knowledge of their respective disciplines oversees this selection procedure. This systematic process guarantees that only excellent, carefully chosen information is added to the database, proving Scopus's legitimacy. Moreover, possessing a curated database necessitates meticulous protocols for content acquisition, contracts with publishers, and technological frameworks to procure articles directly from publishers (Baas et al. 2020).

RESEARCH METHODS

This paper represents a systematic review of literature carried out on the Scopus database to analyze the significance of education in elevating religious moderation in Indonesia. A systemic literature review is a carefully thought-out review that aims to address specific research problems by identifying, choosing, and analyzing the findings of the studies included in the review using an explicit and systematic process (Rother 2007). This method was selected because it comes from a specific research question related to this study. Also, it uses an explicit search approach, comprehensive sources, criterion-based selection, and uniformly applied (Rother 2007). Such characteristics are linear with the work of this study. The steps involved in carrying out a systematic literature review are shown in Figure 1.

from the authors' capabilities, and discussions about religious moderation in Indonesia began when the Minister of Religion introduced it in 2019. The document type selection was also confined to articles, as this investigation centered on outcomes from preceding studies presented as articles within Scopus-indexed journals. The literature search found 14 articles which are shown in Table 1.

Table 1. The Literature Search for Scopus Database

Author (Year)	Title	Journal, Volume (Edition)
Nunu Burhanuddin and Khairuddin (2022)	The Radicalism Prevention Through Academic Policies at State Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia	Ulumuna, 26(2)
Ngainun Naim, Abdul Aziz, and Teguh (2022)	Integration of Madrasah <i>Diniyah</i> Learning Systems for Strengthening Religious Moderation in Indonesian Universities	International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education, 11(1)
Hendra Harmi, Asri Karolina, Irwan Fathurrochman, Fadila, Sholihatul Hamidah Daulay, Eka Apriani and Dadan Supardan (2022)	Analysis of Multicultural Understanding and Moderation of Religion of PAUD Teachers in Bengkulu Province	Pegem Egitim ve Ogretim Dergisi, 12(4)
Hasan Basri, Andewi Suhartini, Asep Nursobah, and Uus Ruswandi (2022)	Applying Higher Order Thinking Skill (HOTS) to Strengthen Students' Religious Moderation at Madrasah <i>Aliyah</i>	Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 8(2)
Muhammad Alqadri Burga and Muljono Damopolii (2022)	Reinforcing Religious Moderation Through Local Culture-Based <i>Pesantren</i>	Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 8(2)
Anzaikhan, M (2022)	The History of Moderate Islam in Indonesia and Its Influence on The Content of National Education	Journal of Al-Tamaddun, 17(2)
Ija Suntana and Betty Tresnawaty (2022)	The Tough Slog of a Moderate Religious State: Highly Educated Muslims and The Problem of Intolerance in Indonesia	HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies, 78(1)
Muhammad Anas Maarif, Muhammad Husnur Rofiq, and Akhmad Sirojuddin (2022)	Implementing Learning Strategies for Moderate Islamic Religious Education in Islamic Higher Education	Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 8(1)
Suhadi Winoto (2022)	Improving Curriculum and Lecturers: Challenges to Quality Based-Technology	Journal of Social Studies Education Research, 13(2)
Faisal Sundani Kamaludin and Tata Septayuda Purnama (2021)	Religious Moderation Strategy in The Virtual Era and Its Implication to Improving the Quality of Education	Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 7(2),
Zaenal Mustakim, Fachri Ali, and Rahmat Kamal (2021)	Empowering Students as Agents of Religious Moderation in Islamic Higher Education Institutions	Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 7(1)

Author (Year)	Title	Journal, Volume (Edition)
Syarif (2021)	Understanding The Teaching of Religious Moderation from A Sufistic Perspective and Its Implications for Student Performance	Journal of Social Studies Education Research, 12(4)
Muhammad Nasir (2021)	Keeping The Middle Path: Mainstreaming Religious Moderation Through Islamic Higher Education Institutions in Indonesia	Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies, 11(2)
Candra Wijaya, Abdurrahman, Edi Saputra, and Firmansyah (2021)	Management Of Islamic Education Based on Interreligious Dialogue in The Learning Process in Schools as An Effort to Moderate Religion in Indonesia	Review of International Geographical Education Online, 11(5)

Screen for Inclusion

The criteria for inclusion in this study are the year of publication, document type, and abstract completeness. The screening procedure was done through such criteria. The year of publication is between 2019 and 2023. This study only uses the articles as the document type so that the book chapter or other types are not included as the literature. In addition, the abstract should provide sufficient information. Therefore, the 14 articles as shown in Table 1 were selected as the literature based on the screening procedure.

Assess Quality

The following step entails assessing the chosen references. After screening for inclusion by reviewing the abstract of the literature and selecting 14 sufficient articles, the researchers assess the quality of such selected literature. Since the literature in this study is limited to the Scopus database, the quality of articles chosen is assumed qualified since Scopus has specific procedures for ensuring the quality of published articles. Also, Scopus has been accredited and recognized internationally as a journal indexer.

Extract Data

Studies that match the criteria in this systematic review are extracted based on the five elements of education. Fourteen selected articles were thoroughly analyzed and synthesized to comprehensively understand education's role in strengthening religious moderation in Indonesia.

Analyze and Synthesize Data

Analysis of the articles was carried out through three stages. First, look at the suitability of the title and keywords used with the substance of the content regarding the role of education in strengthening religious moderation in Indonesia. Second, if the title is appropriate, the abstract is read whether it is for this research. Third, if the abstract is by the objectives of this study, the authors analyze the focus and research results for extraction and synthesis of research results.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The final step in performing a systematic literature review is presenting and reporting the research findings. According to the analysis of 14 articles, As indicated in Table 1, the function of education in strengthening religious moderation in Indonesia. is accomplished through five crucial components: educational objectives, educators, students, learning management, and the educational environment. It is discussed in more detail in the following sub-chapters. Table 2 provides a comprehensive depiction of the role played by each element of the education system in fortifying religious moderation in Indonesia, as derived from the insights of the selected articles.

Table 2. The Role of Education in Strengthening Religious Moderation in Indonesia

Elements	Findings
Educators	Sufficient teachers' capacity to understand multiculturalism and religious moderation helps students broaden their point of view in understanding differences, which is the crucial point of religious moderation (Harmi et al. 2022).
	Strengthening the principles of local wisdom within the context of religious moderation can address the insufficient proficiency of instructors in
Students	Muslim students in state Islamic higher education are receptive to religious diversity and plurality but are not accepting of other religions' sacred
	Students are religious moderation agents. Students are empowered by tolerance, objectivity, openness, and adaptability in interpreting religious texts (Mustakim et al. 2021).
	Students' competencies in IAIN Pontianak were increased through learning religious moderation since they developed professional skills in
Educational Objectives	Indonesia's religious moderation history impacts the national curriculum (Inayatillah et al. 2022).
	Integrating local wisdom in the curriculum encourages tech adoption in teaching (Winoto 2022).
	Islamic higher education curricula in Indonesia, especially in pesantren-style institutions, strongly promote religious moderation by nurturing ideas of national loyalty, integrating local culture, endorsing non-violence, and fostering tolerance (Nasir and Rijal 2021).
	The academic policy incorporates religious moderation values into the curriculum and various campus activities. This includes integrating these values into university mottos, student selections, new student orientations, and skill-building programs to counter radicalism (Burhanuddin and Khairuddin 2022).
Learning Management	Learning strategies in Islamic Higher Education promote religious moderation through diverse methods like lectures, discussions, experiments, and assignments, aligning with <i>Rahmatan Li-al âmin</i> and moderate Islamic principles (Ma'arif et al. 2022).
	Students' religious moderation can be advanced by developing their Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) (Basri 2023).
	Interreligious dialogue is used to discuss integrating religious moderation values into the school curriculum, learning management, teachers, and

Elements	Findings
	Strategic partnerships can improve students' religious moderation through sufficient cooperation between students, teachers, and parents (Kamaludin et al. 2021).
	The internet opens more opportunities to provide various learning resources, such as journals, social media platforms, and websites to prevent hoaxes and hate speech in the name of religion (Mustakim et al. 2021).
Educational Environments	- The Madrasah <i>Diniyah</i> system within Islamic universities contributes to the internalization of religious moderation values (Naim et al. 2022). - By representing <i>Pesantren</i> as the learning resource for multicultural education, religious moderation can be improved (Burga and Damopolii 2022).

Educators

Educators assume the duty of transmitting information and competencies through a range of capacities such as nurturing, directing, and promoting development. As outlined by Law No. 20 of 2003 related to the National Education System, teachers, and educational employees are acknowledged as professionals with a range of responsibilities. The significant roles of teachers in strengthening religious moderation have been highlighted in the selected articles, particularly the capability of teachers and lecturers. Early childhood educators in Bengkulu understood multiculturalism and religious moderation. This sufficient teachers' capacity helps students broaden their point of view in understanding differences, which is the crucial point of religious moderation (Harmi et al. 2022). Regarding technology, the inadequate capability of lecturers in technology-based teaching at State Islamic University could be overcome by strengthening the values of local wisdom within the framework of religious moderation. Hence, lecturers' understanding of religious moderation can affect their capacity to teach using technology (Winoto 2022).

The term religious moderation in these two articles is focused on teachers' knowledge regarding religious moderation and the implementation of local wisdom in supporting teachers' use of technology. As educators, teachers' knowledge regarding religious moderation is critical because teachers are the ones who have direct contact with students, educate students, and direct them by religious and national values (Purbajati 2020). Local wisdom is related to one of the pillars of religious moderation, namely accommodating local culture (Indonesian Ministry of Religion 2019). By emphasizing the importance of promoting local wisdom, the use of technology in learning can be increased because technology is a tool that can make traditional elements of local wisdom more attractive and modern (Achmad 2021).

Many articles also highlight the significant role of teachers in strengthening religious education, although Scopus does not index them. Religion teachers hold a crucial role in imparting religious moderation as they are responsible for teaching religious subjects. Given that the concept of religious moderation is applicable across all religions, teachers from various faiths, this encompasses Islamic religious educators, among others, engaging in the instruction of religious moderation (Akbar 2020; Mubarok and Muslihah 2022; Rahmatika 2022) and Christian religious education teachers (Jura 2020; Marbun 2021; Supriyadi and Waruwu 2022). The references indicate that teachers, overall, have effectively fulfilled their roles as educators in promoting and nurturing religious moderation among students.

Students

Students, including young children in their developmental stage, require support and guidance from the adults around them. They are in the process of seeking knowledge and acquiring skills, still in a phase of physical and psychological immaturity. Within the education system, students form a constituent subsystem. The presence of students within the education system is crucial for facilitating educational endeavors. Apart from being the object of education, students are also the subject of education (Saat 2015).

Students are religious moderation agents. The ability to interpret religious texts with tolerance, impartiality, openness, and flexibility empowers students at an Islamic university in Java. They learned religious moderation through various learning media, such as journals, social media platforms, and websites, to prevent hoaxes and hate speech in the name of religion. In addition, student's performance, which indicates their capacity, significantly strengthens religious moderation (Mustakim et al. 2021). Concerning the Sufistic approach, students' competencies in IAIN Pontianak were increased through learning religious moderation since they developed professional skills in interpreting the Qur'an (Syarif 2021). At state Islamic higher education, Muslim students are receptive to religious diversity and plurality but are not accepting of other religions' sacred books, places of worship, or customs (Suntana dan Tresnawaty 2022). Therefore, students, especially in higher education, hold a pivotal position in promoting religious moderation, as they actively act as agents of religious moderation. They take advantage of studying religious moderation. Their competencies are increased since they learn to broaden their perspective in interpreting the Qur'an. They also tolerate religious diversity and plurality, critical points in religious moderation concepts.

Religious moderation in these three articles focuses on religious tolerance, which is one of the pillars of religious moderation (Indonesian Ministry of Religion 2019). Religious tolerance is tolerance that includes issues of belief in humans related to the faith or divinity in which they believe (Abror 2020). The potential for intolerance in religious life among students still occurs today and deserves our collective attention (Atmanto and Muzayanah 2020). In these three articles, students show religious tolerance through various behaviors of respecting differences in religion. These findings are supported by a non-Scopus article which emphasizes that efforts to moderate students' religious attitudes are formed by providing in-depth religious knowledge, being selective in teaching staff, and being accommodating to local culture (Harahap et al. 2023).

However, as explained in the first article, students do not accept the assessment of holy books, places of worship, and religious customs. It is in line with the findings of the non-Scopus article that strategic steps are needed to increase the role of students in overseeing the internalization of the value of religious moderation in higher education. Students must become pillars of development for future generations who can protect against extremism and radicalism in facing an era of disruption and conflict over diversity, especially in religious practices (Mu'izz 2022). This point is crucial since it indicates that students still need to intensify the tolerance-promoting principles of religious moderation. It becomes more serious since the students in higher education should already have a mature view of religious moderation.

Educational Objectives

The goal of education encompasses the culmination of all endeavors related to educational activities, as every aspect of the education process is aimed at achieving the defined objectives. Hierarchically, the purpose of education can be likened to a ladder, where each step must be ascended to reach the next goal. Progressing to the higher objectives requires first accomplishing the ones below it. If the goals below are not achieved, the higher goals cannot be achieved. For example, to achieve national education goals, it must start with learning goals or indicators, then basic competencies, then competency standards, institutional goals, national education goals, and national life goals. If the indicator is not reached, then standard competencies will not be possible to achieve, and so on. This is what causes national education goals; moreover, national life goals are difficult to achieve, even impossible to achieve, because the goals underneath are difficult to achieve (Saat 2015).

The historical progression of religious moderation affected Indonesia's national curriculum content (Inayatillah et al. 2022). Regarding technology, the curriculum should integrate the local wisdom values, the main component of religious moderation. By integrating local wisdom into the curriculum, educators can be motivated to embrace technology more openly, particularly during instructional sessions. Then, lecturers' capacity in technology-based teaching can be improved (Winoto 2022). In Indonesian Islamic universities, particularly those with a *pesantren*-style approach, the curriculum effectively imparted religious moderation values. These values encompassed national commitment, accommodation of local culture, non-violence, and tolerance which are the main pillars of religious moderation (Indonesian Ministry of Religion 2019). The universities integrate religious moderation differently in their ideology, theory, and practice. Therefore, these two selected articles in this systematic literature review assert that curriculum has contributed to improving religious moderation in education (Nasir and Rijal 2021).

Another aspect of educational objectives is the academic policy which regulates the integration of religious moderation in education. The academic policies of Indonesia's State Islamic Higher Education can prevent radicalism by integrating religious moderation values into the curriculum and various campus activities. This approach encompasses the inclusion of religious moderation principles in university mottos, student selections, new student orientation programs, and skill-building activities to counter radicalism (Burhanuddin and Khairuddin 2022). The radicalism that has emerged in terrorism in the name of religion is a clear sign that intolerance needs to be prevented from an early age because it threatens the existence of diversity or plurality in Indonesia (Samho 2022).

Such findings present the role of educational objectives in integrating religious moderation values into teaching and learning processes. Despite the 2019 inception of the concept of religious moderation, educational objectives have evolved to encompass and address these concerns, including them within the national education content, thus promoting religious moderation. Also, the academic policy and curriculum make religious moderation an essential goal in learning. The academic policy regulates campus activities to integrate religious moderation so students can avoid radicalism. In addition, integrating religious moderation into the curriculum can assist lecturers in enhancing their capacity for technology-based teaching.

Other non-Scopus journals also reveal the crucial role of educational objectives in promoting religious moderation. The Basic Competency of Islamic Religious Education at the Elementary School level, which describes the value of religious

moderation, is only around 46.94%. This result has not yet reached an adequate level of effectiveness in supporting the development of attitudes toward religious moderation, so it is hoped that it can be improved by adding elements of religious moderation (Abidin, 2021). Therefore, the educational objectives have strengthened religious moderation in Indonesia. Efforts to promote moderation at the grassroots are a dynamic process, fluid, and have many dimensions, which are integrated through learning objectives and extracurricular activities in Islamic boarding schools (Ismail 2022). Implementing the inclusive religious education paradigm by modifying its educational objectives is seen as being able to change exclusive religious perspectives and attitudes as a foundation for religious moderation because it prioritizes mutual trust and respect for human equality (Rumahuru and Talupun, 2021).

Learning Management

Learning management is managing and implementing a series of educational tasks that focus on effective and efficient learning through planning, organizing, implementing, evaluating, and assessing to meet educational objectives for the classroom (Gemnafle and Batlolona 2021). The educator's capacity in learning management includes planning, implementing, and evaluating students in the learning process. Good management determines the good and bad of learning, how a teacher uses the proper method, the provision of sufficient learning tools, and a conducive classroom atmosphere (Indarti 2020). Therefore, the management of learning affects the success of learning.

In introducing moderate Islamic religious education, the learning strategies in Islamic Higher Education institutions were implemented through many teaching techniques, including lectures, conversations, experiments, and homework that support *Rahmatan Li-al âmin* (Grace to all nature) and moderate Islamic ideals (Ma'arif et al. 2022). *Rahmatan Li-al âmin* Islamic education is a practice that upholds human principles which makes students and teachers, lecturers and students always practice love and compassion in every educational practice (Suryadi 2023). In Madrasah Aliyah, students' religious moderation can be advanced by developing their Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS). The learning strategy used in this case is connecting *aqidah* in students' daily lives to the religious moderation fundamentals, which facilitates students to understand the context of religious moderation in their simple daily activities (Basri et al. 2022).

Interreligious dialogue is also a critical learning strategy. An effort to moderate religion in Indonesia was made by managing Islamic education in schools based on interreligious dialogue. It used interreligious dialogue to talk about incorporating religious moderation values into school educational programs. Since the conversation involved people with various religions, the discussions also came from multiple points of view, which resulted in formulations that accommodated group and national needs in a balanced manner. Inviting people from different religions to join in one discussion room requires maturity and wisdom in respecting each other's beliefs. It becomes an actual practice of religious moderation that can keep religion in check in the classroom with moderation (Wijaya et al. 2021).

The strategic partnership is promoted as the virtual era's religious moderation strategy. The use of technology increased during online learning from home. It increases the possibility of students accessing learning materials from unreliable sources related to intolerance and radical teaching. Thus, the school provided a religious moderation strategy by providing an Islamic education textbook with a guidebook for students to be open-minded about religious differences. Also, all school

activities were designed to instill religious moderation values. Since students were studying online, parents were involved in controlling their children's activities at home. It is called a strategic partnership since this strategy requires involvement from various parties, namely teachers, parents, and students as a partnership (Kamaludin et al. 2021).

The increased use of technology in the learning processes is also a concern in preparing students in Islamic higher education institutions as religious moderation agents. In contrast to the previous finding that considers technological advancement a challenge in studying, the internet opens more opportunities for teachers to provide various learning resources for students, such as journals, social media platforms, and websites to prevent hoaxes and hate speech in the name of religion (Mustakim et al. 2021). Hence, based on the review from the Scopus database, learning management as a component of the education system has strengthened religious moderation in Indonesia through several learning strategies. It includes using various learning methods and resources, higher thinking order skills, interreligious dialogue, and strategic partnership.

Various studies in the non-Scopus articles also assert the significance of learning management in strengthening religious moderation. It includes the model for implementing religious moderation education through developing the PAI curriculum to present a moderate Islamic movement (Suprpto 2020). Also, the use of radio-based distance learning, kindness trees, and boards that inject values of religious moderation through videos on Google Classroom, which contain the values of tolerance and non-violence (Nisa and Muhlis 2022). Moderation in Islamic religious learning in madrasas and universities must be demonstrated by utilizing learning dimensions that are based on the values of religious moderation, namely, 1) direct learning strategies in the form of practice and indirect strategies in the form of relaxation, 2) learning models with a multidisciplinary approach, inquiry methods, discussion, question and answer techniques, and religious and Indonesian-based learning objectives (Harmi 2022). These approaches are specifically tailored to integrate the principles of religious moderation, thereby aiding the attainment of educational goals.

Educational Environments

The last element of the educational system is the educational environment. In every educational activity, the elements of the environment play a significant role because they can shape a person's character, traits, and character. The environment gives its style and color to human development. Therefore, support is needed from the three spheres responsible for implementing educational activities, bearing in mind that education is the duty of every human being. These environments are the family, school, and community (Rasyid et al. 2020).

The incorporation of Madrasah *Diniyah* learning systems within Indonesian universities can internalize religious moderation values. Madrasah *Diniyah* is a non-formal educational institution that provides classical education and teaches Islamic knowledge to students (Nizah 2016). A two-credit learning pattern takes place every morning from 7:00 to 8:00. Islamic religious instruction is given to students and lecturers over two semesters according to their aptitudes. The assessment findings that have already been completed are used to determine the class. This rigorous year-long study is valuable for enhancing religious literacy, comprehending moderate Islam, and fending off extremism. Nevertheless, as a new system, it faces some

challenges in its implementation, particularly the unavailability of learning facilities and class management (Naim et al. 2022).

Another crucial learning environment is the local culture-based *pesantren* associated with employing *pesantren*, rooted in local culture, to enhance the principles of religious moderation. Religious moderation can be improved by representing *pesantren* as the learning resources for religious moderation. *As the educational environment, Pesantren represents various social groups, organizations, institutions, and networks.* The incorporation of various local cultural values into the multicultural education paradigm is the objective of promoting the based on the culture of the area. Through adopting the *Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jam'ah* philosophy, *pesantren* institutions promote multicultural education that fosters the concept of *wasatīyah* (moderate), harmonizing with the tenets of religious moderation. This approach fosters an inclusive environment where the acceptance of local culture, strong national commitment, and the promotion of tolerance thrive, contributing to a more equitable society (Burga and Damopolii 2022). Therefore, educational environments that play a crucial role in education systems have strengthened religious moderation by providing sufficient learning systems, such as integrating Madrasah *Diniyah* in Islamic universities. They also present the studying place, *pesantren*, as the central resource for learning religious moderation values.

Similarly, some non-Scopus articles highlighted the significance of the educational environment, both formal and informal, in fostering religious moderation. Formal education institutions are the right means for carrying out religious moderation activities because they provide a learning space that is structured, systemic, and easy to evaluate. In non-formal institutions, learning religious moderation is effective in developing national insight because it is built on public awareness, has a doctrinal pattern, and is integrated into the community so that it can effectively stem radical religious ideas that are easily accessed and consumed by the community (Naj'ma and Bakri 2021).

As a formal institution, SMA Selamat Pagi Indonesia Batu has committed to carrying out religious moderation learning through an integrative system, through the process of teaching and learning activities in the classroom and outside the school, such as the dormitory, Kids Village, and in the surrounding environment (Al Faruq and Noviani 2021). The Muhammadiyah Student Association, as a non-formal institution, maximizes the role of Branch Leadership cadres in Bontobiraeng Village, Gowa Regency, in developing and implementing the values of religious moderation through increasing reading literacy, social movements, preventing and handling COVID-19, national dialogue and respect for local traditions (Rahma and Mahmud 2022). Therefore, such environments are beneficial for strengthening religious moderation as the values of religious moderation are further instilled.

CONCLUSION

Various academic papers have reported research on religious moderation from an educational perspective, but studies related to articles in the Scopus journals are still rare. Hence, this study primarily aimed to analyze how education enhances religious moderation using a comprehensive analysis of Scopus database articles, which are accredited and recognized internationally. This systematic analysis focuses on five educational system elements: teachers, students, educational objectives, learning management, and educational environments. In general, teachers have carried out their role as educators in building religious moderation and have

successfully cultivated students' religious moderation. Students in higher education hold a pivotal role in promoting and upholding religious moderation, as they actively act as agents of religious moderation. However, some students do not accept the assessment of holy books, places of worship, and religious customs. It highlights the vital need for students to deepen their understanding of religious moderation, especially in terms of tolerance. It becomes more serious since the students in higher education should already have a mature view of religious moderation.

Educational objectives include the content of national education, the academic policy, and the curriculum that makes religious moderation an essential goal in learning. The purposes of education have improved and accommodated religious moderation values. Besides, learning management as a component of the education system has strengthened religious moderation in Indonesia through several learning strategies, such as the use of various learning methods and resources, higher thinking order skills, interreligious dialogue, and strategic partnership. The last element is educational environments that have strengthened religious moderation by providing sufficient learning systems, such as integrating *Madrasah Diniyah* in Islamic universities. Also, presenting the studying place, *pesantren*, as the primary resource for learning religious moderation values. This study is limited to the context of a systematic literature review on the Scopus database. Even though supporting data from non-Scopus articles has been provided, further studies are needed, especially field studies, to analyze how these findings can be implemented in real contexts in different places. Moreover, Scopus articles found on this theme tend to discuss religious moderation within the framework of Islam only. Therefore, studies from other religious perspectives need to be carried out to add richness to the discussion of education's role in strengthening religious moderation, especially in global publications.

REFERENCES

- Abidin, A. Z. (2021). Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Beragama Dalam Permendikbud No. 37 Tahun 2018. *JIRA: Jurnal Inovasi dan Riset Akademik*, 2(5), Article 5. <https://doi.org/10.47387/jira.v2i5.135>.
- Abror, M. (2020). Moderasi Beragama Dalam Bingkai Toleransi. *RUSYDIAH: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, 1(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.35961/rsd.v1i2.174>.
- Achmad, W. K. S. (2021). Transformasi nilai kearifan lokal berbasis teknologi. *Prosiding Universitas Kristen Indonesia Toraja*, 1(1), 8–16.
- Afwadzi, B., and M. Miski. (2021). Religious Moderation In Indonesian Higher Educations: Literature Review. *ULUL ALBAB Jurnal Studi Islam*, 22(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.18860/ua.v22i2.13446>.
- Akbar, A. (2020). Peran Guru PAI dalam Membangun Moderasi Beragama di SDN Beriwit 4 dan SDN Danau Usung 1 Kabupaten Murung Raya. <http://digilib.iain-palangkaraya.ac.id/2756/>.
- Al Faruq, U., and D. Noviani. (2021). Pendidikan moderasi beragama sebagai perisai radikalisme di lembaga pendidikan. *TAUJIH: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 3(1), 59–77.
- Ar, S. (2020). Peran Guru Agama Dalam Menanamkan Moderasi Beragama. *Al-Irfan : Journal of Arabic Literature and Islamic Studies*, 3(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.36835/al-irfan.v3i1.3715>.

- Atmanto, N. E., and U. Muzayanah. (2020). Sikap Toleransi Beragama Siswa Madrasah Aliyah di Kabupaten Kendal Jawa Tengah. *Jurnal SMART (Studi Masyarakat, Religi, Dan Tradisi)*, 6(2), 215–228.
- Baas, J., M. Schotten, A. Plume, G. Côté, and R. Karimi. (2020). Scopus as a curated, high-quality bibliometric data source for academic research in quantitative science studies. *Quantitative Science Studies*, 1(1), 377–386.
- Basri, H. (2023). Implementasi Kurikulum Merdeka Belajar Pada Pelajaran Akidah Akhlak di Mts Negeri 1 Yogyakarta. *Muróbbî: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, Query date: 2023-06-26 15:11:29. http://jurnal.iaibafa.ac.id/index.php/murobbi/article/view/murobbi_maret23_3.
- Basri, H., A. Suhartini, A. Nursobah, and U. Ruswandi. (2022). Applying Higher Order Thinking Skill (HOTS) to Strengthen Students' Religious Moderation at Madrasah Aliyah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 8(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v8i2.21133>.
- Burga, M. A., and M. Damopolii. (2022). Reinforcing Religious Moderation through Local Culture-Based Pesantren. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 8(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v8i2.19879>.
- Burhanuddin, N., and K. Khairuddin. (2022). The Radicalism Prevention through Academic Policies at State Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia. *Ulumuna*, 26(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujs.v26i2.511>.
- Faisal, M. (2020). Manajemen Pendidikan Moderasi Beragama Di Era Digital. *ICRHD: Journal of Internantional Conference on Religion, Humanity and Development; Vol 1 No 1 (2020): The 1st ICRHD 2020*. <http://conference.iainptk.ac.id/index.php/icrhd/article/view?path=>.
- Gemnafle, M., and J. R. Batlolona. (2021). Manajemen Pembelajaran. *Jurnal Pendidikan Profesi Guru Indonesia (JPPGI)*, 1(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.30598/jppgivol1issue1page28-42>.
- Harahap, R. D., A. H. Nst, I. S. Harahap, M. R. Pulungan, and N. Aisah. (2023). Peran Mahasiswa Kuliah Kerja Nyata (KKN) Dalam Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Serta Moderasi Beragama Di Kelurahan Pandan Kecamatan Pandan Kabupaten Tapanuli Tengah Tahun 2023. *Journal Of Human And Education (JAHE)*, 3 (2), 372–377.
- Harmi, H. (2022). Model pembelajaran pendidikan agama islam berbasis moderasi beragama. *Jurnal Riset Tindakan Indonesia*, 7(2).
- Harmi, H., A. Karolina, I. Fathurrochman, F. Fadila, S. H. Daulay, E. Apriani, and Supardan, D. (2022). Analysis of multicultural understanding and moderation of religion of PAUD teachers in Bengkulu province. *Pegem Journal of Education and Instruction*, 12(4), 128–136. <https://doi.org/10.47750/pegegog.12.04.13>.
- Hidayat, R., and Abdillah. (2019). *Ilmu Pendidikan, Konsep, Teori, dan Aplikasinya* (1st ed., Vol. 1). LPPPI.
- Inayatillah, Kamaruddin and M. Anzaikhan. (2022). The History of Moderate Islam in Indonesia and Its Influence on the Content of National Education. *Journal of Al-Tamaddun*, 17(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.22452/JAT.vol17no2.17>.
- Indarti, L. (2020). *Manajemen Pembelajaran*. GUEPEDIA.
- Indonesian Ministry of Religion. (2019). *Moderasi Beragama*. Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama.

- Islamic Education Directorate General. (2020). *Kemenag Siapkan Program Kerja Rumah Moderasi di PTKI*. Pendis.Kemenag.Go.Id. <https://pendis.kemenag.go.id/read/kemenag-siapkan-program-kerja-rumah-moderasi-di-ptki>.
- Ismail, L. H. (2022). Moderasi Beragama di Lingkungan Pesantren: Pengalaman Pesantren di Bandung Barat, Jawa Barat. *Definisi: Jurnal Agama Dan Sosial-Humaniora*, 1(1).
- Jura, D. (2020). Peran Pendidikan Agama Kristen (PAK) Dalam Semangat Moderasi Beragama Demi NKRI. *Jurnal Dinamika Pendidikan*, 13(3), Article 3. <https://doi.org/10.51212/jdp.v13i3.1979>.
- Kamaludin, F. S., T.S. Purnama, and Z. Zirmansyah. (2021). Religious Moderation Strategy in The Virtual Era and Its Implication in Improving the Quality of Education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v7i2.14944>.
- Kitchenham, B., and S. Charters. (2007). *Guidelines for performing Systematic Literature Reviews in Software Engineering*. 2.
- Kuswanto, E. (2014). Peranan Guru PAI dalam Pendidikan Akhlak di Sekolah. *MUDARRISA: Jurnal Kajian Pendidikan Islam*, 6(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.18326/mdr.v6i2.194-220>.
- Ma'arif, M. A., M. H. Rofiq and A. Sirojuddin. (2022). Implementing Learning Strategies for Moderate Islamic Religious Education in Islamic Higher Education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 8(1), Article 1.
- Marbun, S. (2021). Peran Guru PAK Dalam Menanamkan Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Beragama Pada Peserta Didik. *MAWAR SARON: Jurnal Pendidikan Kristen Dan Gereja*, 4(1), Article 1.
- Mubarok, G. A., and E. Muslihah. (2022). Peran Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam Membentuk Sikap Keberagaman Dan Moderasi Beragama. *Geneologi PAI: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 9(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.32678/geneologipai.v9i1.6616>.
- Murad, A. N., and D. Rizki. (2022). Development of Religious Moderation Study on Prevention of Radicalism in Indonesia: A Systematic Literature Review Approach. *POTENSIA: Jurnal Kependidikan Islam*, 8(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.24014/potensia.v8i2.20727>.
- Mustakim, Z., F. Ali, and R. Kamal. (2021). Empowering Students as Agents of Religious Moderation in Islamic Higher Education Institutions. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v7i1.12333>.
- Mu'izz, A. (2022). Optimalisasi Peran Mahasiswa Dalam Mengawal Internalisasi Moderasi Beragama Di PTKI. *Muktamar Pemikiran Mahasiswa Nasional Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ponorogo*, 1(1), 1–15.
- Naim, N., A. Aziz, and T. Teguh. (2022). Integration of Madrasah diniyah learning systems for strengthening religious moderation in Indonesian universities. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education (IJERE)*, 11(1), 108. <https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v11i1.22210>.
- Naj'ma, D. B. A., and S. Bakri. (2021). Pendidikan Moderasi Beragama Dalam Penguatan Wawasan Kebangsaan. *Academica: Journal of Multidisciplinary Studies*, 5(2), 421–434.

- Nasir, M., and M. K. Rijal. (2021). Keeping the middle path: Mainstreaming religious moderation through Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, 11(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v11i2.213-241>.
- Nisa, K. and M. Muhlis. (2022). Pendidikan Moderasi Beragama di Sulawesi Tengah. *EDUCANDUM*, 8(1), 12–28.
- Nizah, N. (2016). Dinamika Madrasah Diniyah: Suatu Tinjauan Historis. *Edukasia: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Islam*, 11(1).
- Purbajati, H. I. (2020). Peran Guru Dalam Membangun Moderasi Beragama di Sekolah. *FALASIFA: Jurnal Studi Keislaman*, 11(2), 182–194.
- Rahma, N., and A. Mahmud. (2022). Peran Kader PC Ikatan Pelajar Muhammadiyah Barembang dalam Pengembangan Wawasan Moderasi Beragama di Desa Bontobireng Selatan Kecamatan Bontonompo Kabupaten Gowa. *Macora*, 1(2), 32–43.
- Rahmatika, Z. (2022). Guru PAI dan Moderasi Beragama di Sekolah. *TAFAHUS: Jurnal Pengkajian Islam*, 2(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.58573/tafahus.v2i1.19>.
- Rasyid, R., M. Marjuni, A. Achruh, M. R. Rasyid, and W. Wahyuddin. (2020). Implikasi Lingkungan Pendidikan Terhadap Perkembangan Anak Perspektif Pendidikan Islam. *AULADUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Islam*, 7(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.24252/auladuna.v7i2a1.2020>.
- Rother, E. T. (2007). Systematic literature review X narrative review. *Acta Paul Enferm.*, 20(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.1590/S0103-21002007000200001>.
- Rumahuru, Y. Z., and J. S. Talupun. (2021). Pendidikan agama inklusif sebagai fondasi moderasi beragama: Strategi merawat keberagaman di Indonesia. *KURIOS (Jurnal Teologi Dan Pendidikan Agama Kristen)*, 7(2), 453–462.
- Saat, S. (2015). Faktor-faktor Determinan dalam Pendidikan (Studi Tentang Makna dan Kedudukannya dalam Pendidikan). *At-Ta'dib*, 8(2), 1–17.
- Samho, B. (2022). Urgensi “Moderasi Beragama” Untuk Mencegah Radikalisme di Indonesia. *Sapientia Humana: Jurnal Sosial Humaniora*, 2(01), 90–111.
- Suntana, I., and B. Tresnawaty. (2022). The tough slog of a moderate religious state: Highly educated Muslims and the problem of intolerance in Indonesia. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 78(1), Article 1.
- Suprpto, S. (2020). Integrasi Moderasi Beragama dalam Pengembangan Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam. *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama Dan Keagamaan*, 18(3), Article 3. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v18i3.750>.
- Supriyadi, D., and K. M. Waruwu. (2022). Pentingnya Guru Pendidikan Agama Kristen Menanamkan Nilai Moderasi Beragama bagi Peserta Didik. *DIDAKTIKOS: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Kristen*, 5(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.32490/didaktik.v5i1.146>.
- Suryadi, M. (2023). Moderasi Beragama Sebagai Kerangka Paradigma Pendidikan Islam Rahmatan Lil Alamin. *Educandum*, 9(1), 53–62.
- Sutrisno, E. (2019). Aktualisasi Moderasi Beragama di Lembaga Pendidikan. *Jurnal Bimas Islam*, 12(2). <https://doi.org/10.37302/jbi.v12i2.113>.

- Syarif, S. (2021). Understanding the Teaching of Religious Moderation from a Sufistic Perspective and Its Implications for Student Performance. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 12(4), Article 4.
- Wijaya, C., A. Abdurrahman, E. Saputra, and F. Firmansyah. (2021). Management Of Islamic Education Based On Interreligious Dialogue In The Learning Process In Schools As An Effort To Moderate Religion In Indonesia. *Review of International Geographical Education Online*, 11(5), Article 5.
- Winoto, S. (2022). Improving curriculum and lecturers: Challenges to quality based-technology. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 13(2), Article 2.
- Xiao, Y., and M. Watson. (2019). Guidance on Conducting a Systematic Literature Review. *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 39(1), 93–112. <https://doi.org/10.1177/07394556X17723971>.