# Existence and Dynamics of Hajj and Umrah Guidance Groups in Bogor and Jember Regency

## Eksistensi dan Dinamika Kelompok Bimbingan Ibadah Haji dan Umrah di Kabupaten Bogor dan Kabupaten Jember

Zaenal Abidin<sup>1</sup>, Arik Dwijayanto<sup>2</sup>, and Azharuddin Mohd Dali<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Badan Riset dan Inovasi Nasional, Jakarta, Indonesia zaenoo7@brin.go.id

<sup>2</sup> Institut Agama Islam Sunan Giri Ponorogo, Indonesia arik@insuri ponorogo.ac.id

<sup>3</sup> University of Malaya, Malaysia azharud@um.edu.my

Paper received : 5<sup>th</sup> June 2023 Paper revised : 30<sup>th</sup> October 2023 Paper approved : 20<sup>th</sup> December 2023

#### **ABSTRACT**

The community highly trusts Islamic boarding schools as religious, educational institutions in religious formation. Many Islamic boarding schools are participating in the Hajj and Umrah guidance business by establishing the Hajj and Umrah Guidance Group (KBIHU). This article aims to analyze the dynamics of Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU in guiding the Hajj and Umrah in Bogor Regency and Jember Regency. This article uses an ethnographic approach with data collection techniques through interviews and observations conducted at KBIHU in Bogor and Jember. The results of this study show that the presence of KBIHU helps the government's duties and functions in carrying out guidance to Hajj pilgrims as regulated in the Decree of the Director General of Hajj and Umrah Organization (Dirjen PHU) Number 59 of 2019 concerning Operational Guidelines for Guidance Groups. The existence of Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU generally depends on the quality of human resources in management and supervisors. Kiai, as Islamic boarding school caregivers, have qualified knowledge but still need to be competent in guidance and have certificates. They must be more competent in secretarial procedures, guidance agreement documents, participant data, and guidance plans. The supervisory agencies for KBIHU, such as the Directorate General of PHU, the PHU Division of the Regional Office, and the PHU Section of the Ministry of Religion, have not fully implemented the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59 of 2019 in terms of guidance, supervision, control and reporting by the provisions of this decision. In carrying out accreditation, the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion must involve professional institutions to guide KBIHU in reporting, documents and all its obligations. KBIHU reporting and documents must be done digitally using the PUSAKA Application as the Ministry of Religion's Super Apps. Increasing the capacity of KBIHU based on Islamic boarding schools can contribute to the development of foundations/Islamic boarding

**Keywords:** Hajj and Umrah Guidance Group; Hajj Regulation; Implementation; Islamic Boarding School

#### **ABSTRAK**

Pesantren sebagai lembaga pendidikan keagamaan sangat dipercaya oleh masyarakat dalam pembinaan keagamaan. Dewasa ini banyak pondok pesantren yang ikut dalam usaha bimbingan haji dan umrah dengan mendirikan Kelompok Bimbingan Ibadah Haji dan Umrah (KBIHU). Artikel ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis dinamika KBIHU berbasis pesantren dalam bimbingan ibadah haji dan umråh di Kabupaten Bogor dan Kabuoaten Jember. Artikel ini menggunakan pendekatan etnografi dengan teknik pengumpulan data melalui wawancara dan observasi yang dilakukan pada KBIHU di Bogor dan Jember. Hasil kajian ini menunjukkan bahwa kehadiran KBIHU sangat membantu tugas dan fungsi pemerintah dalam melaksanakan bimbingan kepada Jemaah haji sebagaimana diatur dalam Keputusan Direktur Jenderal Penyelenggaraan Haji dan Umrah (Dirjen PHU) Nomor 59 Tahun 2019 tentang Pedoman Operasional Kelompok Bimbingan. Eksistensi KBIHU berbasis pondok pesantren umumnya tergantung pada kualitas SDM pengurus dan pembimbing. Para Kiai sebagai pengasuh pesantren memiliki keilmuannya yang mumpuni tetapi belum kompeten dalam hal pembimbingan dan belum mempunyai sertifikat, dan kurang cakap dalam ketertiban kesekretariatan, dokumen perjanjian bimbingan, data peserta, serta rencana pembimbingan. Instansi pembina bagi KBIHU seperti: Ditjen PHU, Bidang PHU Kanwil, dan Seksi PHU Kankemenag belum sepenuhnya melaksanakan Keputusan Dirjen PHU 59 tahun 2019 dalam hal pembinaan, pengawasan, pengendalian dan pelaporan sesuai dengan ketentuan keputusan tersebut. Kanwil Kemenag dalam melakukan akreditasi perlu melibatkan lembaga profesi, untuk membina KBIHU dalam pelaporan, dokumen, dan seluruh kewajibannya. Pelaporan dan dokumen KBIHU harus dilakukan secara digital menggunakan Aplikasi PUSAKA sebagai Super Apps Kementerian Agama. Peningkatan kapasitas KBIHU berbasis pondok pesantren dapat memberi kontribusi dalam pengembangan yayasan/pondok pesantren, dan memberikan pengetahuan kepada masyarakat.

Kata Kunci: Implementasi; Kebijakan Haji; Kelompok Bimbingan Ibadah Haji dan Umrah; Pondok Pesantren

#### INTRODUCTION

The Hajj and Umrah Guidance Group (KBIHU) in Indonesia is a social, religious institution which provides guidance on the Hajj pilgrimage by providing scientific assistance so that people can understand the rules of the Hajj, Hajj rituals and the Hajj pilgrimage. Article 53, paragraph (1) of Law 8/2019, explains that the Hajj and Umrah Guidance Group (KBIHU) provides guidance and assistance for the Hajj by standardizing guidance and assistance. The involvement of the Guidance Group in organizing guidance for the Hajj pilgrimage is also regulated by the Decree of the Director General of Hajj and Umrah Organization Number: 59 of 2019 concerning Operational Guidelines for Guidance Groups (Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019). In Article 1 Letter d, it is stated that the Guidance Group is a social, religious institution that has received operational permission from the Director General to guide Hajj Pilgrims before leaving for Saudi Arabia, during the trip, and while in Saudi Arabia, until returning to Indonesia (Fathurrahman et al. 2021).

The existence of KBIHU so far, apart from helping the government with many tasks, has also caused various societal problems. This was revealed by Ali Rokhmad, Head of the Worship Guidance Division of PPIH Saudi Arabia, that among the naughty actions carried out by KBIH were forcing Hajj pilgrims into groups that were not theirs and collecting dam fees (fines for the Haji) before the Haji pilgrims had vet to perform the pilgrimage. (Ali Rokhmad 2014). Sodik Mudjahid, Deputy Chair of Commission VIII DPR RI, highlighted the obligation of the Ministry of Religion to educate KBIHU. Education is related to the worship guidance process and the prohibition of brokering dam payments (fines) and wheelchair facilities. Hajj should not be an object of trade and should not make the Hajj pilgrims an exploit of KBIHU's business (Muh Iqbal Marsyaf 2017). Because the role of KBIHU also gives rise to the various problems above, this article attempts to analyze the dynamics of Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU in guiding the Hajj and Umrah pilgrimages. The discussion in this study covers the scope of Article 2 of the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019, which includes licensing, accreditation, obligations of the Guidance Group, implementation of guidance for the Hajj Congregation, financing of guidance, guidance and sanctions.

Islamic boarding schools are community-based Islamic religious education institutions. Currently, many have KBIHU; this is due to the licensing provisions for establishing KBIHU. KBIHU's task is to guide the Hajj pilgrimage, namely the process of providing knowledge to Hajj pilgrims related to Hajj regulations, rituals and pilgrimage journeys. Before departure, KBIHU must guide Hajj pilgrims; the material includes theoretical and practical rituals, Hajj wisdom/spirituality and *akhlaqul karima*. Therefore, Islamic boarding schools in the community support the duties and obligations of providing guidance on the Hajj rituals. This research is an effort to examine/explore the increasing variety of Islamic boarding school businesses in the context of survival strategies while also achieving an essential position in the education system in society.

Several previous studies regarding the Hajj and Umrah have been carried out by researchers and academics with various approaches and perspectives, including (Abdal 2021), (Zahra et al. 2021), (Meutia et al. 2021), (Candra and Oktafia 2021), (Abidin 2020), (Asiyah et al. 2019), (Buddy et al. 2019), (Herman et al. 2019), (Noor 2018), (Permana et al. 2017), (Susilawati et al. 2016). The research above was carried out using qualitative, quantitative or mixed methods. The results of the researchers' study can conclude several things:

First, on the one hand, The presence of KBIHU helps the government regulate congregations, but on the other hand, it co-opts congregations and makes the group system not function as it should. Second, conflict, or, more precisely, contestation, occurs in equal groups between KBIHU and non-KBIHU congregations, or one of the elements is present in quite significant numbers. Third, reality shows that 14.24% of KBIHU still violates the stipulated fee provisions of Rp. 2,500,000.00; (4) weak "meaning" of Hajj because ritual programs focus more on prayer and the practice of tawaf, sai, wearing ihram, or other knowledge; and KBIHU's motive is economic. Opportunities to make a profit are obtained from dam management service fees (packages with pilgrimages, profits from buses), hajj badals, wheelchair jockeys, exchanging riyals, and 'smuggling' high-value items in pilgrims' suitcases (Ishom 2017). There are several indications that KBIHU is taking advantage of this opportunity to gain as much profit as possible. This article differs from the research carried out above in that the author attempts to deepen the operations of KBIHU and also to analyze the implementation of the provisions of the articles in the Director General of PHU Decree 59/2019, published on January 25 2019.

# THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This research uses the concept of policy implementation from the Director General of Hajj and Umrah Organizing, Ministry of Religion, in the form of a Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019. The scope of the guidelines for the Decree of the Director General of PHU includes: first, KBIHU is obliged to fulfil Licensing; second, the Ministry of Religion carries out accreditation of KBIHU; third, the obligations of the Guidance Group; fourth, Implementation of Guidance for Hajj Pilgrims before departure, 15 meetings, guidance materials, and while in Saudi Arabia; fifth, KBIHU guidance financing may charge participants a guidance fee of Rp. 3,500,000.00 (three million five hundred thousand rupiahs); and sixth, coaching is carried out by the Directorate General of PHU, including supervision, control and reporting. KBIHU is a group that guides on the Hajj and Umrah pilgrimages, which has received permission from the Minister. Following Law 8/2019 Article 53 paragraph (1), KBIHU provides guidance and assistance for the Hajj Pilgrimage through standardising guidance and assistance (Zuardi et al. 2021; Buddy et al. 2019).

However, in practice, implementing this regulation is supported by others. The implementation process often has incentive and sanction mechanisms so that the implementation of a policy runs well. Policy impact performance will be produced from policy actions, and the following process is evaluation of policy implementation, performance and impact (M. Nur D 2020).

Sabatier and Mazmanian (1980) in the article "The Implementation of Public Policy" explained that implementation as a concept can be divided into two parts. *First*, implementation as Intention, Output, and Outcome. According to this definition, implementation is a function of aims and objectives, results as products and results from consequences. *Second*, implementation is the functional equivalent of implementation as Policy, Formator, Implementor, Initiator, and Time. The main emphasis of these two functions is on the policy itself, followed by the results achieved and implemented by the implementer within a certain period.

Related concepts used in this research include various things, namely coaching, supervision and control. Coaching is changing something into something new and having more value by planned needs. *A coaching pattern* is a model or reference used to update or build in a better direction (Lapuente and Van de Walle 2020). The purpose of implementing supervision is a managerial approach to prevent the occurrence of

irregularities, waste, misappropriation, obstacles, errors and failures in achieving goals and targets and carrying out organizational tasks as early as possible (Ansar and Musin 2021). Supervision is also helpful for (a) ensuring the implementation of tasks by plans, policies and orders; (b) preventing waste and fraud; (c) guaranteeing the realization of public satisfaction with the goods and services produced; and (d) fostering public trust in organizational (government) leadership (Ansar and Musin 2021). Control is management control, which can be defined as a systematic effort by business management to compare performance with predetermined standards, plans, or goals to determine whether performance is in line with those standards and possibly to take necessary corrective action to see that people and resources other companies that are used most effectively and efficiently possible in achieving society's goals (Mustafa et al. 2020; Wakhid 2017; Pavlić et al. 2017).

#### RESEARCH METHOD

This research uses a qualitative research approach. Field data was collected at 4 (four) Islamic boarding school-based KBIHUs in Bogor Regency, West Java Province and 5 (five) Islamic boarding school-based KBIHUs in Jember Regency, East Java Province. The selection of data collection targets at KBIHU in Bogor Regency and Jember Regency was based on the reason that Bogor Regency and Jember Regency had many KBIHUs based on Islamic boarding schools. This research focuses on Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU operations supported by 2019 Congregation data.

Data collection activities in Bogor Regency and Jember Regency were carried out from July 16 to July 30 2020. The data collection schedule was planned before the departure of the Hajj pilgrims by the ongoing implementation of intensive ritual guidance at KBIHU. However, because in 2020, the COVID-19 pandemic occurred, the impact was that there were no departures for the Hajj pilgrims. Therefore, guidance on the Hajj rituals at KBIHU is needed. During the COVID-19 pandemic, field data collection faced many obstacles, limited social interaction and a tense atmosphere. However, the stages in the research, especially for collecting primary data (interviews and observations) and secondary data information in the form of written documents, can be fulfilled. Collecting primary data with several sources/informants involved, namely: 1) Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU administrators, 2) Management of the Communication Forum/FK KBIHU, 3) Officials/Executors in the Hajj and Umrah Organizing Section of the Regency/City Ministry of Religion Office, and 4) Hajj pilgrims.

Interviews were conducted in-depth with each resource person/informant (PHU Section of Ministry of Religion, Islamic Boarding School Management, KBIHU Management, KBIHU Congregation) using a structured list of questions/Data Collection Instrument (IPD). Secondary data information was obtained from written documents in the form of KBIHU reports. Observations were carried out by paying attention to the condition of KBIHU facilities and infrastructure, guidance aids, practice areas, facilities and infrastructure (buildings, miniature Kaaba, miniatures/pictures of places for throwing jamrah) used in implementing Hajj ritual guidance services. Data analysis in research, according to Miles and Huberman, is carried out through several stages, namely: (1) Data reduction, (2) Data display, and (3) Conclusion (Bungin 2017; Sugiyono 2021).

#### RESULT AND DISCUSSION

### Existence of Hajj and Umrah Guidance Groups (KBIHU)

More pilgrims from Bogor Regency come from rural areas. In 2019, the number of Hajj pilgrims in Bogor Regency was 3,605. The number of female Hajj pilgrims is always greater than male Hajj pilgrims; in 2019, there were women (53%) and men (47%). Based on the education level of Hajj pilgrims in 2019, the majority of Hajj pilgrims graduated from SD/MI and SMP/MTS (55%), SMA/MA (23%), and bachelor's degrees (22%). The Hajj pilgrims are at most 51-60 years old at 34%, based on the most common occupation being homemakers at 44%. Meanwhile, the participation of Hajj pilgrims in KBIHU in 2019 reached 92% who followed KBIHU guidance, and only 8% were independent pilgrims. Bogor Regency has 32 KBIHUs, of which 16 KBIHUs (50%) are based on Islamic boarding schools (PHU Section, Ministry of Religion, Bogor Regency 2020).

The existence of KBIHU in Bogor Regency, in 1973-1980, when the Hajj organizers were still under the Ministry of Home Affairs, Bogor Regency, there was Wahdatul Hujat (currently like KBIHU), which is an institution that guides the rituals of prospective Hajj pilgrims before departure. In 1980-1990, collectors appearing to guide the Hajj pilgrimage emerged, resulting in pros and cons with government officials. The collectors come from (ex-TKI, Biong Tanah, village heads and traders, civil servants and Kiai) because the Hajj pilgrimage makes much money. In 1994, the Department of Religion began to regulate and regulate the existence of the Hajj Guidance Group (KBIH), having to apply for permits with various requirements (Interview with Desi Hasbiyah, Chair of the Bogor Regency KBIHU Communication Forum and Supervisor at KBIHU Ibnu Aqil on July 17 2020)

The guides for Hajj rituals and KBIHU in Bogor Regency in the 1970s included: first, religious figure K.H. Agus Salim, founder of KBIHU Ibnu Aqil, Laladon, Bogor Regency, performed the Hajj pilgrimage in 1971 still using a ship. After K.H. Agus Salim, since 1973, several prospective pilgrims from surrounding villages who were going to perform their pilgrimage asked for guidance on the rituals. As time went on, the number of pilgrims who asked for guidance increased to 3 sub-districts, namely Dramaga, Ciomas and Tamansari (Interview with K.H. Agus Salim, founder and guide KBIHU Ibnu Aqil on July 18 2020). Second, K.H. Warnuddin ZM, founder of KBIHU Syamsul Huda Al Amaliah, Ciawi, Bogor Regency, performed the Haji pilgrimage in 1984. Since 1985, the Department of Religion has been asked to guide rituals to several sub-districts (Cibinong, Depok, Citayam, Ciawi). He goes to carry out his ritual guidance duties using public transportation in the morning and returns home in the afternoon. In each sub-district, there are 2-3 face-to-face meetings. After being a Hajj ritual guide for nine years, K.H. In 1994, the Bogor Regency Regional Government made Warnuddin ZM the Regional Hajj Guidance Team (TPHD) to accompany Hajj pilgrims to Saudi Arabia. K.H. Since 2000, Warnuddin ZM has sent two groups of Hajj pilgrims but still needs KBIH permission. In 2005, the Taklim Council, which had existed for decades, was proposed to become a foundation to fulfil the required permits to establish KBIH Syamsul Huda Al Amaliah (Interview with K.H. Warnuddin ZM, founder of KBIHU Syamsul Huda Al Amaliah on July 18 2020).

The number of Hajj pilgrims in Jember Regency in 2019 was 1,981 people, and the ratio between male and female Hajj pilgrims each year was almost equal; in 2019, there were female pilgrims (51%) and male pilgrims (49%). The distribution of Hajj pilgrims is dominated by educational backgrounds completing elementary/MI and SMP/MTs; the distribution of Hajj pilgrims is in villages, plantations and coastal areas. Jember Regency, as the most extensive rice-producing area (granary) in East

#### Jurnal SMaRT Volume 09 Nomor 02 Desember 2023 DOI: https://doi.org/10.18784/smart.v9i2.1998

Java and known as a tobacco, tea and chocolate plantation area since the Dutch era, reflects the professional background of Hajj pilgrims as farmers and fishermen (60%), entrepreneurs and traders (31.1 %) while civil servants or BUMN employees (2.8%) and others (6%). Based on the age group of Hajj pilgrims in 2019: aged 13-49 (33.7%), aged 50-59 years (44.39%), while Hajj pilgrims aged over 60 years (21.86%) Jember Regency Hajj pilgrims In 2019, 82% followed KBIHU guidance, and 18% were independent congregations. In the Jember Regency, there are 11 KBIHUs, 10 KBIHUs based on Islamic boarding schools, and only KBIHU Al Barakah, the only KBIHU with a Taklim assembly background (Hajj and Umrah Organizing Section, Jember Regency Ministry of Religion Office 2020).

Going on the Hajj pilgrimage to Mecca for Muslims in Jember Regency is something special and a top priority in carrying out the pillars of Islam. This arises from society's diversity, which is influenced by the pattern of Islamic boarding school parenting patterns, including making the kyai the role models and guiding compass of society. This view is also seen in the guidance of Hajj rituals.

"Implementing Hajj ritual guidance at KBIHU North Jember is simpler because generally the pilgrims "follow what the Kiai says." The congregation will imitate the prayers or dhikr that are said, performed, and advised by the Kiai or guide during the Hajj; they will follow (follow along). "It is not uncommon, even though they do not consider prayer to be an obligation, for them, Hajj is a pillar that must be carried out" (Interview with Ahmad Tholabi, Head of PHU, Ministry of Religion, Jember Regency, on July 16 2020)

Examining the history of the founding of KBIH in Jember Regency, the charismatic factor and character of the Kiai, mentors and Islamic boarding school became the magnet and foundation behind the founding of KBIHU. In its journey, the graph of the Hajj Congregation's trust in Kiai and Islamic boarding schools is in a straight line with the number of congregants; the higher the figure of the Kiai and Islamic boarding schools, the more congregants there are. This trust, no doubt, makes the congregation accept what the Kiai gives and entrust them to the travel process during the Hajj pilgrimage in Saudi Arabia—starting from the process of paying off BPIH fees, step by step, the implementation of the Hajj pilgrimage, dam payments, sacrifices and pilgrimages or the Hajj pilgrimage. Islamic boarding school-based KBIHUs in Bogor Regency and Jember Regency are all legal foundations and have formal and non-formal educational institutions. KBIHU must have a permit from the Minister of Religion to provide guidance and assistance for the Hajj pilgrimage by fulfilling all requirements (Interview with Ahmad Tholabi, Head of PHU Ministry of Religion, Jember Regency, on 16 July 2020).

The management of KBIHU is the authority of the Islamic boarding school. However, most administrators are the extended family of Islamic boarding school caregivers (husband, wife, children and in-laws); a small number place their caregivers/educators and alums of the KBIHU congregation as administrators. This condition creates problems at KBIHU (HR and management), so its management is hampered by family management. Example: The management of KBIHU Syamsul Huda Al Amaliyah has had three changes in management and chairman: 2005-2015 as Chairman K.H. Warnuddin ZM (founder); 2015-2019 as Chair of Hj. Nani Seminar (founder's wife); and since 2019, as Chairman of H. Zaenal Mustaqim, S.Pd.I (son-in-law) and Treasurer of Hj. Diniah Mutoharoh (wife of the chairman). In principle, the management is still from the founding family of KBIHU (Interview with Ahmad Tholabi, Kasi PHU, Ministry of Religion, Jember Regency, on 20 July 2020).

Since the establishment of KBIHU based on Islamic boarding schools, there have been differences in characteristics between Bogor Regency and Jember Regency. In Bogor Regency, Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU is primarily a legal entity, foundation and educational institution at the time to fulfil the requirements for establishing KBIHU. On the other hand, in Jember Regency, KBIHU was founded by a foundation with a legal entity and an educational institution/Islamic boarding school that it manages. These very different conditions create different characteristics in their management and existence. Each KBIHU has different characteristics and contributions to the development of educational institutions. Likewise, the infrastructure (secretariat office and room for conducting guidance) at KBIHU in Jember Regency is adequate. This differs from KBIHU in Bogor Regency, where the infrastructure is met along with KBIHU's contribution in providing funds to develop educational foundations/institutions.

## **KBIHU Licensing and Accreditation Problems**

Licensing and accreditation issues arise with the competency provisions for Hajj ritual supervisors, proven by the Professional Hajj Manasik Supervisor Certificate from the Director General of PHU. Some Islamic boarding school-based KBIHUs in the Jember Regency still need to meet the requirements for licensing or accreditation, but in reality, they are safe and not a problem. The competency of Hajj ritual supervisors is crucial, as most of the supervisors at Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU still need the required certificates. However, in reality, the existence of competent and certified Hajj ritual guides still needs to be standard and evenly distributed. The following licensing problem is that the criteria for providing recommendations, verification and visitation carried out by the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of East Java Province are not yet standard (for example, the competency requirements for manasik supervisors and the KBIHU infrastructure, which is still integrated with the foundation/Islamic boarding school infrastructure).

KBIHU Al Qodiri has 6 (six) supervisors to guide the Hajj rituals before departure and while in Saudi Arabia. However, Manasik supervisors must get a Professional Hajj Manasik Guidance Certificate. They are carrying out guidance in Saudi Arabia, collaborating with Mukimin or Santri alums currently studying in Saudi Arabia (Interview with K.H. Taufiurrahman MZ., Chair of KBIHU Al Qodiri on July 21 2020).

Eight advisors are KBIHU Baitul Hikmah resource persons, and only one person has a certificate, namely H.M. Sardi, SE, who took part in the Hajj ritual guidance certification training from May 28 to June 6 2015—obtained a Professional Hajj Manasik Guidance Certificate Number: Dj. The Director General of PHU determined viI.I/1/Hj.01/4648/2015 on July 15, 2015. According to Article 20, paragraph (20) of the Decree of the Director General of PHU D/223 of 2015, the certificate's validity period is 4 (four) years. Thus, KBIHU Baitul Hikmah no longer has a valid certified supervisor. Seven other supervisors could not fulfil the requirements as certification participants, so in the future, KBIHU Baitul Hikmah will not have a cadre of supervisors (Interview with Sardi, Chair and Supervisor of KBIHU Baitul Hikmah, on July 21 2020).

Regarding infrastructure, an example can be from KBIHU Al Ghazaalie, which has a secretariat office measuring 4x4m, containing data on the congregation and secretarial administration, and an open living room measuring 10x6m. The Hajj ritual guidance activity rooms include (1) a hall measuring 50x10 m, which can accommodate 1,000 pilgrims; (2) the mosque, which accommodates 800 worshipers and is used for congregational prayers and Hajj ritual guidance activities. The

provision of ritual materials is often placed in the mosque, which is right in front of the office, and (3) the practice of rituals is carried out in the Islamic Boarding School field the size of a football field (Interview with K.H. Achmad Nasihin, Chairman and Supervisor of KBIHU Al Ghazaali, on July 20 2020).

Islamic boarding school-based KBIHUs in Bogor Regency and Jember Regency all meet the requirements for being a legal entity for a foundation with an Islamic boarding school institution. KBIHU management is mostly family-based, so its management could be more optimal. The secretariat office and space for guidance activities are still one with the school/Islamic boarding school building. Likewise, the room where guidance activities are carried out still uses a mosque/musholla building or Islamic boarding school hall room. KBIHU accreditation and certification of Hajji ritual supervisors is a problem for Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU and needs further exploration. Hajji ritual instructors must have competency with proof of a certificate, which needs to be evaluated. KBIHU is based on an Islamic boarding school; although the scientific abilities of its Kiai supervisors are qualified, many still need to get certificates. The issue of KBIHU accreditation and supervisor certification is more within the authority of the Directorate General of PHU and the Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religion to carry out evaluations.

# **KBIHU Dynamics: Between Obligations and Rights**

KBIHU's obligations include compliance with statutory regulations, having a work agreement with Hajj pilgrims, and having complete participant data. The data and work agreements made by KBIHU are different from those in the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019. KBIHU Al Ghazaalie has made a guidance agreement or agreement with the congregation. This agreement is a clause on the rights and obligations between KBIHU and the congregation. However, the format must refer to the attachment to Article 6 point b of the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019. Likewise, the documents of the guidance congregation, which are registered in the agreement form, are neatly recorded; the data included in the manifest includes name, portion number, congregation address and contact person. However, the data does not include/record archives of gender, age, or education level as stated in Article 6 point c Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019. When filling out the registration form, you also do not include your education level and gender (Interview with Abdul Wakhid, KBIHU Bismika administrator on July 21 2020).

KBIHU's obligation to prepare a guidance plan and implement the guidance activity schedule has been prepared, but the implementation differs. According to the provisions, guidance to the congregation before departure is carried out at least 15 face-to-face/meetings, where there are no JPL provisions, so there are KBIHU which exceed and fall short of the provisions. Every time there is a meeting, each KBIHU has 1 JPL, 2 JPL and 3 JPL, and the weight of the material is not regulated in the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019 or the form of a syllabi. The Kiai resource persons usually lead the tahlil and karakul Karima material before starting the guidance material, so they often dominate the weight of the meeting hours. On the other hand, there is guidance material that has not been fulfilled, especially on "Rights and Obligations of Hajj Pilgrims" and "Tips for Achieving Mabur Hajj and its Preservation", as stated in Article 7 point a2 of the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019 (Susilawati et al. 2016; Santoso 2019).

It is implementing Hajj ritual guidance at KBIHU Ibnu Aqil while in Indonesia before departure, which is carried out at least 15 times to 27 face-to-face/face-to-face meetings 25 times and practice two times. This year's manasik guidance begins on

#### Jurnal SMaRT Volume 09 Nomor 02 Desember 2023 DOI: https://doi.org/10.18784/smart.v9i2.1998

December 9 2019, for six months and ends when pilgrims depart for Saudi Arabia. KBIHU has a miniature Kaaba made of cloth that can be disassembled. The practice of manasik was carried out twice, namely at the Pondok Gede Haji Dormitory and at the Cibinong Regional Government (Interview with Desi Hasbiyah, Chair of the Bogor Regency KBIHU Communication Forum and Supervisor at KBIHU Ibnu Aqil, on July 27 2020).

KBIHU has fulfilled the implementation of face-to-face/meeting ritual guidance 15 times on average. The problem is that the andragogy guidance method is still dominant with lectures, and there still needs to be more discussions, questions and answers, and practice. The competence of manasik instructors still needs to be more professional, and many still need certificates. Every KBIHU tries to gain the community's trust and fulfil the satisfaction of the Hajj pilgrims. KBIHU still has many issues and problems in implementing guidance on Hajj rituals. Elis Sya'adah stated that many Hajj ritual instructors still need to be more competent and professional; only around 42% of the ritual advisors have been certified (Sya'adah 2017).

The learning method in the KBIHU Bismika Hajj rituals is through a lecture, question and answer, discussion and role-playing learning approach. Specifically for implementing the Hajj, apart from audio visuals, practice is also carried out using miniatures or mannequins. Meanwhile, prayers and other supporting services for the Hajj are carried out through assignments. On the other hand, there is also additional material outside of Article 7 point a2 of the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019, namely in the form of a special event at the end of Ramadhan in the form of joint i'tikaf at the PP Riyadus Sholihien Mosque. Then the practice of rituals at the Sukolilo Haji Surabaya Dormitory as well as a pilgrimage to Kiai Khalil Bangkalan (Interview with H.M. Madini Farouq, General Chair of KBIHU Bismika, on July 27 2020)

KBIHU Baitul Hikmah's ritual guidance is carried out in 20 meetings between 09.00 and 11.00 WIB. The meeting continued with several consultations until, before the midday prayer time, the meeting was over. The guidance method uses lectures; the time for questions and answers is only around 10%. The implementation of Hajj ritual guidance in Indonesia in 2019 started on January 6 2019, and went to May 19 2019, with 20 theoretical and practical meetings. Each meeting contains two guidance materials by two resource persons. Next, the guide accompanies the congregation while at the Bekasi Haji Dormitory. Guidance is provided on the plane for those taking migot in Yalamlam, then guidance on reading the Talbiyah on the Jeddah-Mecca journey. Followed by guidance on preparations for going to the Grand Mosque to carry out Tawaf, Sa'I and Umrah. The congregation's activities are waiting for Tarwiyah day to take part in the obligatory prayers at the Grand Mosque, as well as pilgrimages to essential places (Jabal Nur, Jabal Rahmah, Arafah, Mina and Musdalifah). From the 8th to the 14th, Dzulhijah carried out the Hajj pilgrimage from Mecca, Arafah, Muzdalifah, Mina and the Grand Mosque. The following nine days in Medina involve mandatory prayers at the Nabawi Mosque and pilgrimages (Raudhoh, Bagi, Jabal Hud, Qiblatain Mosque, Quba Mosque and Date Market (Interview with Sardi, Chair and Supervisor of KBIHU Baitul Hikmah, on July 21 2020).

Implementing manasik guidance in Saudi Arabia takes the form of strengthening material on Hajj rituals while in accommodation (hotels), during travel and before departure for the Sunnah Hajj and Umrah pilgrimages. KBIHU Bismika and KBIHU Ibnu Aqil carry out the Tarwiyah sunnah worship, where the congregation will first leave for Mina on the 7th of Dzulhijjah and then stay in Mina on the 8th of Dzulhijjah and then head to Arafah on the 9th of Dzulhijjah. The mentor must provide exceptional guidance regarding the process and implementation of the tarwiyah

sunnah, this implementation is outside the government's Hajj implementation program (Susilawati et al. 2016).

Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU is still unable to fulfil several obligations, including the Hajj guidance agreement form not using the existing format; participant data does not comply with the provisions; still collecting the Hajj pilgrims' living costs for payment purposes (dams, pilgrimages and city tours); It also has not resulted in the congregation's independence both in terms of rituals and travel. The implementation of problem guidance is more based on andragogy methods such as adult learning. The problem is that there are still many manasik instructors whose competence still needs to be standardized and certified. On the other hand, many Hajj pilgrims have low educational backgrounds, having completed elementary/MI and SMP/MTs, and most pilgrims are over 50 years old.

#### **Financing Issues**

Funding for participating in ritual guidance for all KBIHU based in Islamic boarding schools in Bogor Regency is IDR—3,500,000.00 (three million five hundred thousand rupiah), by the maximum or maximum provisions. The budget for KBIHU, which has a congregation of 1 group (45 people), can only help with 10% of foundation/education development. The budget realization for KBIHU, which has a congregation of 3 groups, has been able to help with the development of foundations/education by approximately 30%. Expenditures are mainly used for supervisor fees (BPIH, honorarium and transportation) between 30-50%, and as much as 30%-40% are used for consumption, participant attribute equipment, and ATK. The remaining 10% -20% is used for orphanage operations, management, and balances (Interview with Muslimin, Head of Hajj and Umrah Organizing Section, Bogor Regency Ministry of Religion, on 27 July 2020).

For example, for foundation/education development, KBIHU Daarul Istiqomah charges a ritual fee from the congregation of Rp. 3.5 million with global usage of Rp. 2.5 million is used for honoraria and transportation for prayer guides in Indonesia and Saudi Arabia, provisions for making uniforms such as national batik with combinations, transportation, congregation equipment and consumption (snacks and lunch). Rp. 1 million is used for foundation/education development, especially for facilities and infrastructure. At the beginning of 1986, the new foundation had 350 meters of land; now it has 5,000 meters, where 1,000 meters are certified waqf land (Interview with Fikri, Management and Supervisor of KBIHU Daarul Istiqomah, on 21 July 2020).

The cost to take part in Hajj ritual guidance at KBIHU based in Islamic boarding schools in Jember Regency is only between Rp. 1 million—Rp. 2 million; it is said that the fee/in faq collected from the congregation is only half of the maximum/ maximum allowance. The amount of fees/infaq for KBIHU, which has a congregation of 3 to 4 groups (150 to 200 congregations), can help develop the foundation/education. However, for KBIHU Al Qodiri, which charges a tutoring fee of only Rp. 1 million with 68 congregations, it does not seem possible to allocate for foundation/education development (Interview with KH Taufiqurrahman, Chair of KBIHU Al Qodiri on 21 July 2020).

The problem in collecting guidance fees from the congregation arose when KBIHU still charged other fees (dam, qurban, city tour, pilgrimage, and sunnah umrah), and some also charged fees for sunnah tarwiyah. Collecting other fees as intended in Article 8, paragraph (2) of the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019 is difficult to understand in practice. KBIHU is still collecting or collecting

money collectively by the team leader, followed by the group leader and received by the KBIHU supervisor. The term collection by KBIHU has been replaced with the words (congregation entrusts, collectively, at the will of the congregation, or the congregation is elderly), which means that almost 100% of the dam costs are collected to KBIHU. In reality, in the field, most Indonesian Hajj pilgrims need to gain the knowledge and experience to pay for dams independently, which can be done by pilgrims both in Mecca and Medina according to Endang Jumali, the Head of Daker Mecca PPIH issued a Circular in the form of an announcement of four places for payment of dams and sacrifices, namely: Saudi Arabia Post Office, Al Rajhi Bank, Jamiyah Hadiyat Al Hajj Muktamirin Al Khayriyah Charity Agency and Jamiyah Namaa Al Khayriyah Charity Agency (Republic of Indonesia Ministry of Religion 2019).

Thus, the fees for attending ritual guidance at KBIHU in Jember Regency are below the provisions. However, KBIHU in Bogor Regency all collect a maximum/maximum of Rp—3.5 million, where these fees significantly contribute to the development of foundations/Islamic boarding schools. KBIHU in Jember Regency needs to emphasize the amount of fees collected from the congregation. The contribution of fees for developing foundations/Islamic boarding schools depends more on the number of congregations. The more congregations there are, the more significant the role for the development of foundations/education.

KBIHU development is the responsibility of the Director General of PHU, the implementation of which is carried out by the Head of the PHU Division of the Provincial Ministry of Religion and the Head of the PHU Section of the Regency/ Municipal Ministry of Religion. The coaching mechanism is carried out every day, where KBIHU is the government's working partner, and there is also the role of KBIHU Communication Forum (FK) administrators in each region. In Bogor Regency, it can be handled whenever there is a problem with organizing the Haji pilgrimage. However, the demands from KBIHU administrators often need to be lowered. They need to understand that the duties and functions of the PHU Section of the Regency/ Municipal Ministry of Religion are only as implementers. Those who have authority lie with the Directorate General of PH. Technical problems often occur are related to determining congregations into groups; this is crucial. For example, related first, the KBIHU management continues to ask its congregation to become one guidance group and does not want to be separated. Second, KBIHU, which only has a congregation of 50 people, urgently requests a mentor to accompany the congregation to Saudi Arabia (Indonesian Ministry of Religion 2019).

The Director General of PHU carries out the implementation of coaching, which includes supervision, control and reporting. The coaching includes various activities related to worship guides, including certification of Hajj ritual guides. The data collection results at Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU in 2 districts show that only a few KBIHU supervisors have certificates, and some still need certified supervisors. In supervision, the Director General of PHU is directly assisted by the Head of the Regional Office and the Regency/City Ministry of Religion, meaning that it has been delegated to the PHU Section staff. For reporting, all KBIHU must make and submit it to the Director General of PHU, which has been collected at the Head of PHU Section of the Regency/City Ministry of Religion (Abidin Z 2020).

# Discussion

KBIHU, based in Islamic boarding schools in Bogor Regency and Jember Regency, has all fulfilled the requirements for being a legal foundation. Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU administrators still tend to be in one family; this does not violate statutory regulations, but management cannot be optimal. The accreditation and competency of certified managerial supervisors for Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU are essential to study further. The required guide must have competence in the field of Hajj rituals with proof of having a Professional Hajj Manasik Guidance Certificate, which must also be evaluated. KBIHU is based in an Islamic boarding school; although the supervisors are Kiai, who are knowledgeable, many still need certificates. The issue of KBIHU accreditation is more within the authority of the Directorate General of PHU, carried out by the Provincial Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion. In carrying out accreditation, it is necessary to involve professional institutions rather than PHU officials and staff.

Many Islamic boarding school-based KBIHUs in their operations are still not by the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019, including: 1) the Hajj guidance agreement does not comply with the existing format, 2) participant data does not match, 3) there is still a collection of living costs for Hajj pilgrims for payment purposes (dams, pilgrimages and city tours), 4) does not create independence for the congregation in terms of rituals and travel.

The problem is that there are still many manasic instructors whose competence is not yet standard and not yet certified; on the other hand, the Hajj pilgrims are dominated by low educational backgrounds, having completed elementary/MI and SMP/MTs, and the age of many of the pilgrims is over 50 years. The collection of guidance fees from participants/congregations by Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU in Jember Regency is entirely under the provisions of Article 8 of the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019. IDR is the entire collection of guidance fees from participants/congregations by Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU in Bogor Regency. 3.5 million, "at most," per Article 8 of the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019. This tuition fee collection positively contributes to the development of Islamic boarding school foundations/boarding schools. The amount of guidance fees collected from the congregation for Islamic boarding schoolbased KBIHU in Bogor Regency is crucial for operational costs and foundation/ educational development. This differs from the Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU in Jember Regency, which is less concerned with collecting fees from the congregation (congregants who take guidance can spend as much as they can), even though they contribute to the development of the foundation/Islamic school The contribution of Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU to the development of foundations/education is mainly due to the large number of participants/congregations who take part in guidance on the Hajj pilgrimage.

The presence of Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU helps the duties and functions of the Ministry of Religion in carrying out guidance to Hajj pilgrims. In order for Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU to continue to exist in carrying out its operations, it can be done by: 1) improving the quality of human resources for administrators and supervisors, 2) the Kiai as supervisors are all qualified but not yet competent and must be certified, 3) improving secretarial order, guidance agreement documents, participant data and guidance plans.

The Directorate General of PHU, as the KBIHU supervisory agency, still needs to fully implement the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019. Therefore, it is necessary to reformulate the guidance by the contents of the provisions of the existing articles. Training so far, which includes supervision, control and reporting, still needs to be improved. Likewise, reporting files from KBIHU should be utilized more so they only consist of piles of reports at the Regency/City Ministry of Religion Office.

Therefore, the Directorate General of PHU needs to develop steps in reporting, documents and all KBIHU obligations are carried out digitally using the PUSAKA Application as a Super App of the Ministry of Religion, R.I. KBIHU as a government partner needs to continue to increase its capacity in various aspects. An empowered KBIHU can contribute to developing foundations/Islamic boarding schools. Guidance on Hajj rituals carried out by KBIHU is the Islamic boarding school's missionary role in reminding Muslims to carry out the fifth pillar of Islam. So, the existence of KBIHU in Islamic boarding schools is essential to support the development of Islamic boarding schools and is helpful for the community.

#### **CLOSING**

Establishing KBIHU in Islamic boarding schools helps the government, in this case, all levels of the Ministry of Religion, carry out worship guidance to Hajj pilgrims. Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU in Bogor Regency and Jember Regency in its operations include Licensing; Guidance Group Obligations, Implementation of Guidance for Hajj Pilgrims, and Guidance Financing have implemented the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019 Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019. The quality of human resources and facilities owned by Islamic boarding schools support the success of Islamic boarding school-based KBIHU in implementing guidance on Hajj rituals. KBIHU development by the Ministry of Religion must be more professional and fully guided by the Decree of the Director General of PHU 59/2019. To increase KBIHU's capacity related to the secretariat, reporting and documents must be done digitally using the PUSAKA Application as the Ministry of Religion's Super Apps.

Islamic boarding schools as community-based Islamic religious education institutions must take part in providing knowledge to the community. Islamic boarding schools' institutional dynamics must continue innovating by developing many businesses, including establishing KBIHU. For Pondok Pesantren to continue its existence, it must be ready to compete to continue to develop and increase its role in helping the government's duties while increasing its presence in society.

#### REFERENCES

- Abdal, Abdal. 2021. "Implementasi Kebijakan Tentang Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Haji dalam Upaya Meningkatkan Pelayanan Jemaah Haji di Kabupaten Garut." *Jurnal Inovasi Penelitian* 2(1):129–36.
- Abidin, Zaenal. 2020. "Survei Kepuasan Pelayanan Jemaah Haji Di Dalam Negeri." Jakarta (ID): Badan Litbang Dan Diklat Kemenag RI.
- Ali Rokhmad. 2014. "Kemenag Akan Beri Sanksi KBIH Nakal." Kemenag.Go.Id.
- Ansar, Tahmit, and Yuliana Musin. 2021. "Manajemen Pelayanan Ibadah Haji Kantor Kementerian Agama Kabupaten Konawe, Sulawesi Tenggara." Jurnal ekonomi, sosial dan humaniora 3(01):55–61.
- Asiyah, Aas, Irfan Sanusi, Ali Aziz, and Ali Aziz. 2019. "Fungsi Perencanaan Dalam Penyelenggaraan Pembinaan Manasik Ibadah Haji." *Tadbir: Jurnal Manajemen Dakwah*. https://doi.org/10.15575/tadbir.v4i4.1708.
- Buddy, Tabroni, and Fahruddin Salim. 2019. "Pengaruh Kualitas Pelayanan Dan Kepercayaan Terhadap Kepuasan Pelanggan Dan Dampaknya Pada Reputasi Perusahaan (Studi Empiris Pada Perusahaan Travel Umroh Dan Haji Di Jakarta Timur)." *Jurnal Ekonomi Bisnis Dan Manajemen*.

- Bungin, Burhan. 2017. "Metodologi Penelitian." Jakarta: Kencana.
- Candra, Almun Wakhida, and Renny Oktafia. 2021. "Penerapan Manajemen Pelayanan Prima Untuk Peningkatan Kepuasan Calon Jamaah Haji Dan Umrah Di PT Mabruro Sidoarjo." *Jurnal Ilmiah Ekonomi Islam.* https://doi.org/10.29040/jiei.v7i1.1811.
- Fathurrahman, Reza, Zaenal Abidin, and Anisa Dwi Utami. 2021. "Public Service Satisfaction on Hajj-Related Services in Indonesia: Demographic Analysis." *AL* -*MUZARA'AH* 9(1):99–107.
- Helmi, Tedi, R. Akhmad Munjin, and Irma Purnamasari. 2017. "Kualitas Pelayanan Publik dalam Pembuatan Izin Trayek oleh DLLAJ Kabupaten Bogor". *Jurnal Governansi* 2(1):51–62. https://doi.org/10.30997/jgs.v2i1.209.
- Herman, Murdiansyah, Normajatun Normajatun, and Desy Rahmita. 2019. "Kualitas Pelayanan Haji dan Umrah pada Kantor Kementerian Agama Kabupaten Hulu Sungai Tengah". *AS-SIYASAH: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik*. https://doi.org/10.31602/as.v3i1.1722.
- Kemenag RI. 2019. Bimbingan Ibadah Haji Dan Umrah.
- Lapuente, Victor, and Steven Van de Walle. 2020. "The Effects of New Public Management on the Quality of Public Services." in *Governance*.
- M. Nur D. 2020. "Manajemen Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Haji." *Yonetim: Jurnal Manajemen Dakwah*.
- Meutia, Intan Fitri, Bayu Sujadmiko, Devi Yulianti, Kristian Adi Putra, and Savira Nur Aini. 2021. "The Agenda Setting Policy for Hajj and Umrah in Post Pandemic."
- Muh Iqbal Marsyaf. 2017. "DPR Warning KBIH Yang Jadikan Haji Sebagai Objek Dagang." Sindo News.
- Muslimin. 2020. Wawancara Dengan Kasi Penyelenggara Haji Dan Umrah Kemenag Kabupaten Bogor.
- Mustafa, Delly, Umi Farida, and Yusriadi Yusriadi. 2020. "The Effectiveness of Public Services through E-Government in Makassar City." *International Journal of Scientific and Technology Research*.
- Noor, Muhammad. 2018. "HAJI DAN UMRAH." *Jurnal Humaniora Dan Teknologi* 4:38–42.
- Pavliæ, Ivana, Marija Martinoviæ, and Meri Šuman Toliæ. 2017. "Measurement of Local Public Services' Quality Using Servqual: The Case of Dubrovnik." *Ekonomska Misao i Praksa* (2):593–610.
- Permana, Sona Sofyan, Syamsuddin RS, and Arif Rahman. 2017. "Optimaliasi Fungsi Pengorganisasian Dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Pelayanan Ibadah Haji." *Tadbir: Jurnal Manajemen Dakwah.* https://doi.org/10.15575/tadbir.v2i4.573.
- Sabatier, Paul, and Daniel Mazmanian. 1980. "The Implementation of Public Policy: A Framework of Analysis." *Policy Studies Journal* 8(4):538–60.
- Santoso, Joko Dwi. 2019. "Buku Saku Ibadah Manasik Haji Dan Umroh Berbasis Android." *Pseudocode* 6(2):156–63. https://doi.org/10.33369/pseudocode.6.2.156-163.
- Seksi PHU Kemenag Kab.Bogor. 2020. Dokumen Data Jemaah Haji Bogor.

#### Jurnal SMaRT Volume 09 Nomor 02 Desember 2023 DOI: https://doi.org/10.18784/smart.v9i2.1998

- Sugiyono. 2021. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif.* cetakan ke. edited by S. Y. Suryandari. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Susilawati, Iseu, Ahmad Sarbini, and Asep Iwan Setiawan. 2016. "Implementasi Fungsi Manajemen Dalam Pelayanan Bimbingan Manasik Haji Di Kelompok Bimbingan Ibadah Haji." *Tadbir: Jurnal Manajemen Dakwah*. https://doi.org/10.15575/tadbir.v1i2.135.
- Sya'adah, Elis. 2017. "Efektivitas Pelatihan Sertifikasi Dalam Meningkatkan Profesionalisme Pembimbing Manasik Haji Pada Kanwil Kementerian Agama Provinsi Banten Tahun 2016."
- Wakhid, Ali Abdul. 2017. "Reformasi Pelayanan Publik Di Indonesia." Jurnal TAPIs.
- Zahra, Fatimah Al, Mukhlisin Saad, Sri Wahyuni, Dwi Putri, Universitas Nurul, Jadid Paiton, Universitas Islam, Negeri Sunan, Ampel Surabaya, and Jawa Timur Indonesia. 2021. "Strategi Pemasaran dalam Bimbingan Ibadah Haji; Sebuah Upaya Meningkatkan Volume Jamaah Haji (Studi Kasus Pada KBIHU Nurul Haramain Probolinggo Jawa Timur Indonesia)." *HARAMAIN: Jurnal Manajemen Bisnis* 1(2).
- Zuardi, Muhammad, Tantan Hermansah, JM. Muslimin, and Rahman Ahdari. 2021. "Effect of Service Quality and Price Fixing Hajj Guidance Group to The Satisfaction of Congregation Perform The Pilgrimage." in *Proceedings of the 3rd International Colloquium on Interdisciplinary Islamic Studies, ICIIS* 2020, 20-21 October 2020, Jakarta, Indonesia. EAI.